

6-12-15

To: Caltrans Encroachment Permits, Oakland

Subject: Are Millbrae red light camera Encroachment Permits justified by the collision history?

The City of Millbrae operates red light cameras at three intersections, two of which are on or adjacent to State highways and are operated under Caltrans Encroachment Permits issued in September 2009.

On September 5, 2014 I asked Caltrans for copies of "all current issued encroachment permits for red light cameras in Millbrae" and for "the justification the City provided." On October 2, 2014, Caltrans mailed responsive documents to me. PDFs of all those documents are attached to this email (excluding copies of the large format construction plans).

As justification for the Permit to install the red light camera monitoring the two southbound El Camino Real (RT 82) to eastbound Millbrae Avenue left turn lanes, the City created and submitted to Caltrans a one-page document entitled Collision Diagram 2005-2009, which showed nine collisions in five years. One of those nine collisions (date 9-4-2005) involved a "Sig/Signs" violation by a left-turning motorist; all the other collisions depicted on the Diagram involved other movements or violations other than CVC 21453. At a very busy intersection is one collision in five years sufficient to justify the installation of a red light camera which to cover its rent during a five year period must generate at least 3000\* tickets bearing \$1,500,000 in fines and which during just the last calendar year (2014) generated 1744 tickets bearing \$872,000 in fines?

As justification for the Permit to install the red light camera monitoring turns from the southbound RT 101 offramp at Millbrae Avenue, the City created and submitted to Caltrans a one-page document entitled Collision Diagram 2004-2008, which showed 17 collisions in five years. Caltrans also sent me a copy of that same Diagram bearing hand-annotations by an unknown person. The City submitted Traffic Collision Reports for 12 of the 17 collisions plus two more Reports for collisions whose dates were not shown on the City's Diagram.\*\* Copies of the Diagrams and the Reports are attached.

Of the 14 collisions, one (date 1-13-04) involved a CVC 21453 (red light) violation by a motorist using the southbound offramp. That motorist struck a bicyclist, with no injury.

Another of the 14 (date 11-5-08) was listed on the City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 as "sig/signs" but SWITRS shows the Primary Collision Factor as "ALC/DRG." SWITRS shows two injuries with Extent: "comp pn."

The remaining 12 collisions involved other locations or violations other than "sig/signs" and CVC 21453. Is two collisions (with two minor injuries) in five years at a very busy intersection sufficient to justify the installation of a red light camera which to cover its

rent during a five year period must generate at least 3000\* tickets bearing \$1,500,000 in fines and which during just the last calendar year generated 3891 tickets - mostly for right turns - bearing \$1,946,500 in fines?

Please consider the revocation of both permits.

Sincerely,

Jim

\*Millbrae pays rent of \$5395 per camera per month and receives approximately \$100 of revenue for each ticket issued.

\*\*Per Mr. Lim's 8-20-09 email to Caltrans, three of the 17 collisions shown on the US101/Millbrae collision diagram involved only property damage, so no collision reports were written.

#### Details of My US101/Millbrae Avenue Collision Analysis

Number in ( ) refers to sequence in attached PDF of Millbrae/101 Traffic Collision Reports.

1-2-04: Date is shown on City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 but no Traffic Collision Report was received by me. SWITRS does not show a collision on Millbrae Avenue or RT 101 near Millbrae Avenue on that date.

1-3-04: Date is not shown on City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 but I received a Traffic Collision Report. Both vehicles were proceeding straight westbound. PCF was unsafe speed. CVC 14603 was noted as at fault driver was age 16. No injuries. (12)

1-13-04: Date is not shown on City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 but I received a Traffic Collision Report. Driver at fault entered intersection from middle lane of southbound offramp, hit bicycle. PCF: CVC 21453 and CVC 21201 (no bike headlight?). No injuries. (13)

6-22-05: Location was at offramp from northbound RT 101. (14)

11-16-05: Location was 321 feet east of offramp from southbound RT 101. (4)

12-9-05: On City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 date is shown in error as 12-19-05. Driver at fault was westbound on Millbrae Avenue and ran signal controlling entry to intersection of Millbrae Avenue and the southbound offramp. (3)

8-31-06: Driver at fault entered intersection from southbound offramp at excessive speed, rolled. PCF: CVC 22350. (5)

1-6-07: On southbound offramp, rearend, DUI and speed. PCF: CVC 23152(a). (6)

8-23-07: Location was at offramp from northbound RT 101. (7)

10-12-07: On southbound offramp, rearend, speed, wet road. PCF: CVC 22350. (8)

11-28-07: Location was at offramp from northbound RT 101. (9)

1-17-08: Location was at RT 101 overpass. (10)

2-20-08: No Collision Coding page received by me. City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 shows a left turn from ramp and "improper turn" while hand-annotated copy of same Diagram indicates a left turn from ramp and "wet speeding hit curb." SWITRS (copy attached) shows PCF as "unsafe speed," no injuries. (11)

8-9-08: No Collision Coding page received by me. City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 shows a right turn from ramp and "unsafe lane change" while hand-annotated copy of same Diagram says "fail to yield." SWITRS (copy attached) shows both vehicles westbound prior to the crash, the PCF as "ROW Auto," the Collision Type as "sideswipe," and one injury with Extent "comp pn." Without a Collision Coding page I cannot tell if the at fault driver, or the other driver, or both drivers, approached from the southbound offramp. (1)

11-5-08: No Collision Coding sheet received by me. City's Collision Diagram 2004-2008 shows a straight ahead movement from ramp and "sigs/signs." SWITRS (copy attached) shows the at fault vehicle was southbound, the PCF as "Alc/Drug," the Collision Type as "broadside," and two injuries with Extent "comp pn." (2)

\*\*\*\*\*

Include State Highways cases

Report Run On: 06/09/2015

2	DRVR	23	M	O	PROC ST	E	A	0100	SUBAR 2006	-	3	-	-	-	-
3	DRVR	44	F		PROC ST	E	D	2200	CHEVR 2004	-	-	-	-	-	-

Primary Rd EAST MILLBRAE AV Distance (ft) 0 Direction Secondary Rd RT 101 NCIC 4110 State Hwy? Y Route 101 Postmile Prefix - Postmile 18.032 Side of Hwy S  
 City Millbrae County San Mateo Population 3 Rpt Dist 15 Beat 004 Type 0 CalTrans 4 Badge 101 Collision Date 20080220 Time 0823 Day WED  
 Primary Collision Factor UNSAFE SPEED Violation 22350 Collision Type OTHER Severity PDO #Killed 0 #Injured 0 Tow Away? Y Process Date 20081203  
 Weather1 RAINING Weather2 Rdwy Surface WET Rdwy Cond1 NO UNUSL CND Rdwy Cond2 Spec Cond 0  
 Hit and Run Motor Vehicle Involved With FIXED OBJ Lighting DAYLIGHT Ped Action Cntrl Dev FNCTNG Loc Type R Ramp/Int 4

Party Info														Victim Info												
Party	Type	Age	Sex	Race	Sobriety1	Sobriety2	Move Pre	Dir	SW Veh	CHP Veh	Make	Year	SP Info	OAF1	Viol	OAF2	Safety Equip	ROLE	Ext Of Inj	AGE	Sex	Seat Pos	Safety	EQUIP	Ejected	
1F	DRVR	41	F	O	HNBD		LFT TURN	E	A	0100	BMW	1994	-	3	N	-	M	G	DRVR	COMP PN	22	M	1	0	G	-

Primary Rd EAST MILLBRAE AV Distance (ft) 0 Direction Secondary Rd RT 101 NCIC 4110 State Hwy? Y Route 101 Postmile Prefix - Postmile 18.031 Side of Hwy S  
 City Millbrae County San Mateo Population 3 Rpt Dist 15 Beat 004 Type 0 CalTrans 4 Badge 111 Collision Date 20080809 Time 0628 Day SAT  
 Primary Collision Factor R-O-W AUTO Violation 21800A Collision Type SIDESWIPE Severity INJURY #Killed 0 #Injured 1 Tow Away? Y Process Date 20090430  
 Weather1 CLEAR Weather2 Rdwy Surface DRY Rdwy Cond1 NO UNUSL CND Rdwy Cond2 Spec Cond 0  
 Hit and Run Motor Vehicle Involved With OTHER MV Lighting DAYLIGHT Ped Action Cntrl Dev FNCTNG Loc Type R Ramp/Int 4

Party Info														Victim Info												
Party	Type	Age	Sex	Race	Sobriety1	Sobriety2	Move Pre	Dir	SW Veh	CHP Veh	Make	Year	SP Info	OAF1	Viol	OAF2	Safety Equip	ROLE	Ext Of Inj	AGE	Sex	Seat Pos	Safety	EQUIP	Ejected	
1F	DRVR	22	M	B	HNBD		MERGING	W	-	-00	MAZDA	1994	-	3	N	-	M	G	DRVR	COMP PN	22	M	1	0	G	-
2	DRVR	41	M	B	HNBD		CHANG LN	W	I	1000	OTHER	2005	-	3	N	-	M	G								

Primary Rd EAST MILLBRAE AV Distance (ft) 0 Direction Secondary Rd RT 101 NCIC 4110 State Hwy? Y Route 101 Postmile Prefix - Postmile 18.063 Side of Hwy N  
 City Millbrae County San Mateo Population 3 Rpt Dist 15 Beat 001 Type 0 CalTrans 4 Badge 110 Collision Date 20080831 Time 0300 Day SUN  
 Primary Collision Factor DRVR ALC|DRG Violation 23152A Collision Type HIT OBJECT Severity PDO #Killed 0 #Injured 0 Tow Away? Y Process Date 20090410  
 Weather1 CLEAR Weather2 Rdwy Surface DRY Rdwy Cond1 NO UNUSL CND Rdwy Cond2 Spec Cond 0  
 Hit and Run Motor Vehicle Involved With FIXED OBJ Lighting DARK - ST Ped Action Cntrl Dev FNCTNG Loc Type R Ramp/Int 3

Party Info														Victim Info													
Party	Type	Age	Sex	Race	Sobriety1	Sobriety2	Move Pre	Dir	SW Veh	CHP Veh	Make	Year	SP Info	OAF1	Viol	OAF2	Safety Equip	ROLE	Ext Of Inj	AGE	Sex	Seat Pos	Safety	EQUIP	Ejected		
1F	DRVR	22	M		HBD-UI		RAN OFF RD	E	A	0100	ACURA	1998	-	3	A	22107	H	M	G	DRVR	COMP PN	22	M	1	0	G	-

Primary Rd EAST MILLBRAE AV Distance (ft) 77 Direction S Secondary Rd RT 101 NCIC 4110 State Hwy? Y Route 101 Postmile Prefix - Postmile 18.031 Side of Hwy S  
 City Millbrae County San Mateo Population 3 Rpt Dist 15 Beat 004 Type 0 CalTrans 4 Badge 103 Collision Date 20081105 Time 1453 Day WED  
 Primary Collision Factor DRVR ALC|DRG Violation 23152A Collision Type BROADSIDE Severity INJURY #Killed 0 #Injured 2 Tow Away? Y Process Date 20090629  
 Weather1 CLEAR Weather2 Rdwy Surface DRY Rdwy Cond1 NO UNUSL CND Rdwy Cond2 Spec Cond 0  
 Hit and Run Motor Vehicle Involved With OTHER MV Lighting DAYLIGHT Ped Action Cntrl Dev FNCTNG Loc Type R Ramp/Int 4

Party Info														Victim Info												
Party	Type	Age	Sex	Race	Sobriety1	Sobriety2	Move Pre	Dir	SW Veh	CHP Veh	Make	Year	SP Info	OAF1	Viol	OAF2	Safety Equip	ROLE	Ext Of Inj	AGE	Sex	Seat Pos	Safety	EQUIP	Ejected	
1F	DRVR	24	M	H	HBD-UI		RGT TURN	S	A	0100	HONDA	1997	-	3	M	-	L	G	DRVR	COMP PN	24	M	1	0	G	-
2	DRVR	29	M	W	HNBD		PROC ST	W	D	2200	FORD	2007	-	3	N	-	M	G	DRVR	COMP PN	29	M	1	0	G	-

Primary Rd EAST MILLBRAE AV Distance (ft) 0 Direction Secondary Rd RT 82 NCIC 4110 State Hwy? Y Route 82 Postmile Prefix - Postmile 15.946 Side of Hwy S  
 City Millbrae County San Mateo Population 3 Rpt Dist CENT Beat 003 Type 0 CalTrans 4 Badge 108 Collision Date 20080126 Time 2248 Day SAT  
 Primary Collision Factor IMPROP TURN Violation 22107 Collision Type HIT OBJECT Severity INJURY #Killed 0 #Injured 1 Tow Away? Y Process Date 20080926  
 Weather1 RAINING Weather2 Rdwy Surface WET Rdwy Cond1 NO UNUSL CND Rdwy Cond2 Spec Cond 0  
 Hit and Run Motor Vehicle Involved With FIXED OBJ Lighting DARK - ST Ped Action Cntrl Dev FNCTNG Loc Type I Ramp/Int 5

Party Info														Victim Info													
Party	Type	Age	Sex	Race	Sobriety1	Sobriety2	Move Pre	Dir	SW Veh	CHP Veh	Make	Year	SP Info	OAF1	Viol	OAF2	Safety Equip	ROLE	Ext Of Inj	AGE	Sex	Seat Pos	Safety	EQUIP	Ejected		
1F	DRVR	40	M		HBD-UI		LFT TURN	E	A	0800	PONTI	1997	-	3	A	23152	-	L	B	DRVR	COMP PN	40	M	1	0	B	-